

Report to: Communities Scrutiny Committee

Date of Meeting: 14th June 2012

Lead Member/Officer: Joint Head of Highways & Infrastructure

Report Author: Section Manager: Passenger Transport

Title: Bus Services and Reductions

1. What is the report about?

To advise members of how bus services are organised, changes to the way in which the Welsh Government (WG) funds bus & related services, the consequences for the County Council, proposed mitigation and to start a consultation process.

2. What is the reason for making this report?

To provide information and seek observations on changes to the way bus services are funded which will have a marked impact on fares and levels of service provided.

3. What are the Recommendations?

That:

- 3.1 the report be noted;
- 3.2 officers consult with the wider community as regards potential bus service cuts; and
- 3.3 following the consultation, the Joint Head of Highways & Infrastructure produces a further report, for Cabinet, summarising the results of the consultation and proposing specific measures, in line with the timescale demanded by the Welsh Government and the budget available.

4. Report details

- 4.1 Bus services in Denbighshire are the best they have ever been, certainly since the very lean years of the very early 1970s. This follows increasing numbers travelling free of charge under the Cerdyn Cymru arrangements for people over 60 (and those with certain disabilities). It reflects additional County Council & WG funding that has helped fund newer, accessible vehicles and provided improvements in frequency.
- 4.2 Bus services in Wales (as elsewhere other than in London & Northern Ireland) fall into three categories:

- Commercial services. These are funded largely by passengers paying fares or by free travel reimbursement in lieu of fares (for those over 60 or with certain disabilities). Most daytime services in the north of Denbighshire are commercial, together with the X94 and service 5 (both serving Corwen & Llangollen) in the south. The County Council has no direct control over this type of service.
- Contract services. These are socially necessary services that are subsidised by the County Council where an operator is not prepared to run commercially. Much of the network to the south of the county is under contract.
- Other services. These tend to be hybrid services that operate commercially under some form of agreement, with additional funding from the County Council. An example is the X50 bus service from Denbigh & Ruthin to Wrexham.

- 4.3 The status of each bus service in Denbighshire is summarised in Appendix 1.
- 4.4 The bus network has evolved incrementally over a number of years, particularly since the deregulation of bus services in 1986. This follows commercial operators' changes and the County Council's reactions to them and, in some cases, funding opportunities that have presented themselves.
- 4.5 The level of service provided in any given area depends upon a number of factors such as its population size & demographic make-up; and the proximity to shopping, work, education & leisure facilities. The level of service will differ at varying times of day and days of the week. Urban areas can, of course, support higher levels of bus service, particularly during the daytime, and are usually able to sustain a commercial level of service. The proportion of commercial mileage in Denbighshire is approximately 85 per cent.
- 4.6 Denbighshire has been fortunate to enjoy a relatively stable and growing local bus market. Commercial operators, especially in the north, have been able to maintain and even grow services in recent years. Most inter-urban corridors elsewhere have seen improvements, either commercially or following the receipt of internal or external funding.
- 4.7 Where commercial operators have proposed changes that potentially impact negatively on passengers, following an assessment, County Council officers have generally been able to fill gaps in provision. Key determinants include considering whether the service is used for work or education purposes; rurality (where there is often no alternative to the bus); time of day; day of the week; and the likely cost of the provision.

- 4.8 WG is changing the way it helps support bus services in the future. Bus operators receive revenue from several sources, all of which are or will be affected by recent WG announcements. These were initially made in either January or February 2012, too late for consideration under the Council's budget pressures. For the County Council, this includes a reduction in Local Transport Services Grant (LTSG) from £396,000 to £288,000, over a full year.
- 4.9 Subsequently, WG has offered a minimum of three months' transitional funding, possibly extending to six or even nine. Its extension is dependent upon a national, strategic ministerial review of funding that may see radical change. At the time of writing, the Minister has set up a review group and Denbighshire is represented via Taith, the regional transport consortium. It is too early to predict the outcome but it might include consortia rather than operators receiving Bus Service Operators Grant (BSOG). This may afford the consortia and therefore each county council more control over commercial bus services. The Minister is very clear in that he wishes in future to deal more with the four consortia than individual county councils.
- 4.10 Notwithstanding these potential future funding changes, the County Council needs to plan for an imminent reduction in WG bus funding. It needs to be in a position to react swiftly.
- 4.11 Appendix 2 gives details of the way in which bus services are funded and the impact of the WG's changes. Appendix 3 suggests where future changes might be made. This will need to accommodate service pressures for changes to bus services and the modest overspend in 2011/12. The savings required are approximately £145,000 over a full year on combined 2011/12 budget of £911,000. Most of the proposed changes will prove unpalatable and, for the reasons stated in Appendix 3, it is recommended that the Council consults. Stakeholders may put forward alternatives they feel are more palatable.

5. How does the decision contribute to the Corporate Priorities?

Cuts in passenger transport services have a negative impact on corporate priorities especially for

(a) older and younger people (who are most reliant on public transport) and

(b) in terms of the environment (higher fares & fewer services will discourage bus use and increase car journeys).

Additionally, they impact on the Wales National Transport Priorities of sustainability, supporting economic growth and social inclusion. It impacts additionally on disabled people.

6. What will it cost and how will it affect other services?

- 6.1 Up to £146,000 in a full year plus up to a possible further £60,000. In addition, officers may not know the level of reaction as regards commercial operations (because of BSOG and FCT reductions) for some time. Should further commercial services be withdrawn, it is conceivable that they will be carrying more passengers than current supported services, by virtue of their being commercial for a long period.
- 6.2 The affects are shown in the Appendix 2.
- 6.3 If commercial services are withdrawn, the Council may need to consider the priority of providing these against existing supported services.
- 6.4 The impact of the cuts will affect the environment (see 5 (b) above).

7. What consultations have been carried out?

- 7.1 This is an initial paper that considers the need for future consultation.

8. Chief Finance Officer Statement

The reductions to WG funding will create a cost pressure in the service. In the current climate, there is an expectation that services attempt to contain pressures within existing resources. The full impact of this in financial and service delivery terms should also be highlighted during the forthcoming service challenge process and in the budget round in the autumn.

9. What risks are there and is there anything we can do to reduce them?

Political — cuts proposed during an election period

Financial — in not bringing in the cuts immediately.

Reputational — in being unable to meet contract operators' requests for additional funding to mitigate BSOG reductions and in shouldering negative PR.

Environmental — potential for increased car journeys.

Corporate — reductions during a time when there are corporate strategies to assist an ageing demographic (on average, at least 40 pc of bus users are 60 or over) or younger people (another important segment of bus users).

Contact Officer:

Section Manager: Passenger Transport

Tel:01824 706847

Appendix 1—Denbighshire Bus Services (service status)

Service	From/to	Peak	Off-peak weekdays	Evenings	Sundays
1, 1A 2	Ruthin – Mold	Contract	Contract		
X1	Ruthin – Mold - Chester		Contract		
5	Corwen – Llangollen – Wrexham	Commercial	Commercial	Contract	Commercial
5A	Chirk – Llangollen – Wrexham				Commercial
X5	Corwen - Ruthin - Denbigh	Contract	Contract		
6	Denbigh Town/Llanefydd		Contract		
11	Rhyl – Prestatyn – Chester			Contract	
12	Rhyl – Llandudno	Commercial	Commercial	Commercial	Commercial
13	Prestatyn – Glan Clwyd – Llandudno	Commercial	Commercial	Commercial	Commercial
14	Denbigh – Mold	Contract	Contract		
18/19	Rhyl – Prestatyn – Holywell	Contract	Contract		
35/36	Rhyl – Prestatyn – Dyserth – Rhyl	Commercial	Commercial	Contract	Contract
38	Prestatyn Town		Commercial		
45/46	Rhyl – Kinnel Bay – Towyn – Bodelwyddan – Glan Clwyd	Contract	Contract		
47	Rhyl Town		Contract		
X50	Denbigh – Ruthin – Wrexham	Contract	Agreement	Contract	Contract
51	Denbigh – Rhyl	Commercial	Commercial	Commercial	Commercial
X52	Denbigh – Rhyl	Commercial	Commercial	Contract	Contract
54	Rhyl – St Asaph Business Park	Contract			
62	Denbigh - Nantglyn - Llansannan		Contract		
64	Llangollen - Chirk - Ceiriog Valley		Contract		
70	Villages south of Ruthin to Ruthin		Contract		

73	Ruthin Town		Contract		
76	Denbigh - Llandyrnog - Ruthin - Graigfechan		Contract		
77	Ruthin - Llanelidan		Contract		
83/84	Rhyl Town	Agreement	Agreement	Agreement	
91	Melin y Wig - Corwen - Llangollen		Contract		
X94	Barmouth - Corwen - Llangollen - Wrexham	Agreement	Agreement	Contract	Contract
95	Melin y Wig - Corwen - Bryneglwys - Wrexham		Contract		

Appendix 2—Changes to funding, implications and consultation

The changes affect the following areas:

Direct subsidy from local authorities

1. The County Council financially supports a raft of mainly rural and inter-urban bus services that would otherwise not operate without subsidy. Funding comes from in-house budgets and from the WG's Local Transport Services Grant (LTSG). Nationally in 2012/13, WG is reducing LTSG from £11m to £8m. All authorities will receive 27 per cent less. For Denbighshire, this amounts to £108,000 over a full year (from £396,000 to £288,000). With the transitional arrangements, this will result in a cut of between £54,000 and £81,000 in the first year.
2. The position regarding the Highways & Infrastructure budget is that the £515,000 budget is continuing unchanged.

Bus Services Operators Grant (BSOG)

3. This is effectively a fuel duty rebate. Operators of both commercial and contract services are entitled to claim back about 47p per litre of the fuel duty they pay. From 1st September 2012 rather than April as initially planned, WG is reducing this by 25 per cent to 35p. This brings it into line with a similar change in England. The difference is that English operators have benefited from 18 months' notice, so could better plan for such a shift.
4. Even though the decrease was deferred, operators had no time to reverse planned increases in bus fares. These were already perceived as high but operators have little alternative. GHA put up fares by some 20 per cent. Arriva has increased adult fares and altered the child concession from half to a third off. It has withdrawn return fares. Such increases will result in fewer people travelling by bus. This will impact on the viability of some commercial services and may result in further withdrawals requiring Council consideration. Locally, to date, Arriva has reduced the daytime frequency of its Denbigh to Rhyl service back to every 20 minutes. Neither GHA nor Arriva can rule out further changes. The position in Denbighshire is perhaps less uncertain than areas to its west, owing to the overall high performance of Arriva's Rhyl garage.
5. It is estimated that, for the commercial services in the area, the impact of WG's changes will be around £180,000 p.a. (over a full year), some of which will be recouped in higher fares. There will inevitably be a lag in notification of commercial changes or withdrawals, as operators continue to assess the implications of the BSOG reduction.
6. In terms of contracted, subsidised services to which the Council contributes, one operator has so far requested an increase to help mitigate the loss of BSOG and other inflationary pressures. If they were

all to ask the Council for the entire shortfall, this could be in the region of £60,000 over a full year.

7. As stated in paragraph 4.9 of the main report, future BSOG is under consideration by the minister.

Free concessionary travel (FCT) reimbursement

8. This is not a subsidy as such. It is an indirect payment to operators to reimburse them for carrying older and certain disabled people free of charge.
9. Operators are paid for each free journey undertaken. WG applies a modifying factor for each journey. This reduces the claim because it assumes that more people will travel because the scheme is free than had they paid a fare. This was 73.59 per cent. WG initially reduced the modifying factor to 70 per cent but, from April 2012, has subsequently reverted back to the previous figure. Depending upon budgets, WG may decide to alter the modifying factor in the future while still expecting operators to carry the same number of passengers but, for now, this area is of less concern. Were this to change, this will inevitably result in “ordinary” fare paying passengers shouldering an additional fares burden.

The Community Transport Concessionary Fares Initiative (CTCFI)

10. This affects Denbighshire Dial-a-Ride (DAR), an organisation that provides door-to-door services for people in north Denbighshire who cannot use bus services. Over the last four years, DAR has benefited from being one of the CTCFI so-called pilots that enabled DAR’s members to travel free on the same basis as they would had they been able to use a bus. The pilots were designed to demonstrate whether CTCFI could or should be applied elsewhere. The scheme has been threatened annually. In 2012/13, WG will no longer be supporting the pilots although, again, there is an element of transitional funding, for three months. This means DAR will be without funding of some £86,000 p.a. (over a full year).
11. Unlike the other grants or reimbursements above, DAR was given more reasonable notice of this withdrawal but it nevertheless places this charitable organisation in some jeopardy. Officers have been working with DAR to try to make them more robust encouraging DAR to quote for contract-type work, with some limited success. In addition, the BSOG reduction will affect DAR. The consequence for DAR is either a reduced service or increase Council subsidy (the Council currently contributes some £27,000 per annum, including for Night Rider, an evening transport scheme for older people in the north of the county).

On bus revenue (cash fares)

12. Operators have already put up fares, as a result of some of the above.

Cumulative Effect

13. The cumulative effect of these changes will have a significant impact on and further weaken the provision of local bus services. In addition, insurance, labour and fuel costs continue to increase, with diesel fuel expected to be a significant issue in 2012, with operators expecting a minimum 11 per cent rise.

14. The full year financial impact of WG's decisions on operators may be summarised as follows, all shown on a full year basis:

Grant/reimbursement	Affecting	Impact	Estimate/Actual
LTSG in Denbighshire	Bus operators, DAR	£108,000	Actual
BSOG	Commercial operators & DAR	£180,000	Estimates
	Contract operators	£60,000	
FCT	Bus operators	£0	Estimate
CTCFI	DAR	£86,000	Actual
WORST CASE TOTAL		<u>£434,000</u>	

15. Other than as mentioned above, the full impact on commercial services is still not yet fully known, as this will lag. The impact on supported services means an immediate reduction in budget. In 2011/12, the overall transport subsidy comprised:

Highways & Infrastructure	£515,400
LTSG	<u>£396,000</u>
Total	£911,400

LTSG additionally helps fund bus services and community transport plus an element of LTSG towards staffing, publicity and bus infrastructure. Assuming a standstill Council budget, the change for 2012/13 is as follows:

Highways & Infrastructure	£515,000
LTSG	<u>£288,000</u>
Total	£803,000

The 27 per cent funding cut in LTSG equates to an overall reduction of 12 per cent, over a full year. The transitional funding in 2012/13 reduces the impact in the first year.

16. Note that approximately £168,000 of the current budget is effectively protected because services carry workers and/or students, or form part

of a wider agreement with an operator over the purchase of new buses (e.g. £20,000 per annum over five years for the Rhyl Town Services).

17. It is therefore necessary to reduce the local transport expenditure in line with the revised budget. This is by a minimum of £108,000. It may also be necessary to reduce this by up to a further £60,000 should contractors require additional funding because of a drop in BSOG.
18. At the close of 2011/12, there was a modest overspend on bus service support of £12,000 that will need to be reduced.
19. Previous budgetary pressures have tended to be accommodated within the budget. In addition, there are two new unmet pressures, the first of which is significant:
20. Notification of the main pressure came too late for the budget setting process, following the relocation of eye clinic services in May from the former H M Stanley to Abergele Hospital. The site at H M Stanley was perfectly placed for frequent bus services between Ruthin, Denbigh, St Asaph, Rhuddlan and Rhyl. The new location, with up to 10 buses a day to Abergele only, is far less convenient for public transport. In spite of the dire budgetary position, there remain calls for a service, the most basic of which is by demand responsive community transport that may still prove to be inflexible but will cost £20,000 as compared to an off-peak bus service of £55-£61,000. To provide for this additional link there would need to be a commensurate reduction in bus services.
21. There is a call from residents of Tremeirchion who enjoy a six-days-a-week bus service to Rhyl for there to be a limited service to Denbigh. This, in theory, can be provided by withdrawing the Rhyl service on one or two days, though this will increase operator costs marginally, as the bus needs to be in Rhyl for subsequent work. This will increase costs marginally by £6,000, for which a subsequent reduction is required.

Potential Cuts

22. The cumulative position regarding budgets over a full (in 2013/14 and subsequent years) is as follows:

Council budget	£515,000	
LTSG	<u>£396,000</u>	£911,000
Expected expenditure	£923,000	
<u>Less</u> Reduction in WG funding	£108,000	
<u>Less</u> Pressures – inflation	£24,000	
<u>Less</u> Pressures – additional services	<u>£26,000</u>	<u>£765,000</u>
Shortfall (full year)		<u>£146,000</u>

That for 2012/13, with transitional funding, is likely to be:

Council budget	£515,000	
LTSG	<u>£396,000</u>	£911,000
Expected expenditure	£923,000	
<u>Less</u> Reduction in WG funding	£54,000	
<u>Less</u> Pressures – inflation	£12,000	
<u>Less</u> Pressures – additional services	<u>£13,000</u>	<u>£844,000</u>
Shortfall (part year)		<u>£67,000</u>

As yet, it is unclear as to the amount of time expected for transitional funding. The figures above assume six months.

23. To accommodate pressures and inflation, the Council therefore needs to plan for a minimum reduction in the funding of £182,000 over a full year, this being the sum spent in 2011/12 less that available in 2013/14. Additionally, it would be prudent to consider a contingency of a further £60,000 over a full year, should this be required paragraph 17.
24. All bus and other passenger transport services supported by the Council are ranked according to their cost to the Council per passenger, in Appendix 3. Those seen most suitable for cuts or held in reserve are shown.
25. The methodology used in an attempt to identify cuts is as follows:
- Whether the cut can be made easily, with minimal impact
 - The cost to the council per passenger carried
 - Whether there is a cheaper alternative approach
 - Whether the services are rural, inter-urban or urban in nature
 - Whether they carry students and or workers
 - Whether they are part of an agreement other than a contract to which the Council remains bound
 - Whether community transport services should be protected at least at current budgetary levels
 - The overall revenue cost of a service
26. Timing is important. In order to make a change, an operator is obliged to give a minimum of 56 days' notice to the Traffic Commissioner. The Council should give an additional 28 days' notice to the contractor. The longer the Council leaves its decisions, the deeper the cuts in the current financial year. Should WG fund a transitional arrangement for the first six months till the end of June, the Council will need to make £67,000 in direct cuts (including pressures). Delaying until, say, January, and the first year effective cut would be £100,000 equivalent.
27. Timing will also be affected by any desire to consult. The Council has a good and improving record regarding bus service consultation. The

Campaign for Better Transport has been successful at judicial review in halting Cambridgeshire County Council's desire to reduce bus services because the Council failed to consult (at all). In Denbighshire's case, as elsewhere in Wales, time is still very much of the essence and it simply may prove impractical to consult fully. Consultation will take at least an additional 28 days plus time to assess any results and report, as necessary, to members.

28. In addition to local members and town & community councils, consultation might wisely include the Rural Transport Forum (RTF), plus one or more drop-in bus surgeries.

29. From a decision to consult, the timescales could therefore be:

	Days
Consultation	28
Assessment/members	28
Notice to contractors	28
Notice to Traffic Commissioner	<u>56</u>
TOTAL	140

Based on this timetable and a start towards the end of June 2012, unless the changes were agreed as more urgent, the earliest possible timetable change would be November 2012.

30. Subject to formal agreement with the Corporate Director Learning & Communities, it may be possible to use an underspend in the home to school transport budget, delegated to the Head of Highways & Infrastructure, to offset the impact of a late decision, in year one only, for the period between the end of a six months' WG transitional arrangement and the actual implementation. This would cost £18,000.

Appendix 3

Green – proposed no change

Amber – contingency: £60,000 over full year

Red – proposed detrimental changes: £145,000 over full year

Service	From/To	Subsidy per passenger	Commentary	Proposals Tranche 1	Saving Tranche 1	Proposals Tranche 2	Saving Tranche 2
1, 2	Ruthin – Mold	£2.44	Performing well in terms of cost/passenger. Carries students and workers to both Ruthin and Mold	Return to 2008 service pattern (withdrawing one bus worth of work off peak)	£18,000		
X1	Ruthin – Mold – Chester	£2.07	New service from 2009 replacing previous Ruthin-Chester service withdrawn following changes by Flintshire and Cheshire West & Chester Councils	No action			
P1	Cadole – Ruthin	£0.00	Operates schooldays only and carries mainly students	No action			
5	Llangollen - Wrexham	N/A	Contribution to WCBC for evening services. Understood to perform well. Supports the Llangollen visitor economy	No action			
X5	Corwen – Ruthin/Denbigh (0730 ex-Corwen)	£4.73	The 0730 journey from Corwen to Denbigh is paid for individually and, for an inter-urban service, performs well. There are some 17 passengers per journey including workers and students for Denbigh College, Denbigh High and St Brigid's	No action			

X5	Corwen – Ruthin/Denbigh	£6.35 (Corwen section)	A fairly weak service but the only one north of Corwen for Maes Afallen, Clawdd Poncen, Gwyddelwern, Pandy'r Capel, Bryn SM, Pwllglas and parts of Llanfair DC,. Stronger over short section Corwen to Clawdd Poncen	Corwen-Ruthin section: Continue to operate broadly hourly because to reduce to every two hours would result in bus/driver standing down for one hour in every two. Withdrawal of the 1640 Mondays to Fridays journey from Ruthin and return	£16,000		
				Denbigh-Ruthin section: This operates combined half-hourly with X50. Reduce to hourly on Saturdays. No cost/passenger figures available. Withdraw Saturday journeys to operate hourly only (less demand for this service on Saturdays)	(As above)	Withdraw half-hourly off-peak services Ruthin and Denbigh but retain hourly service	£20,000
6	Denbigh Town Service/Llanefydd	£1.23	This service performs well. Contribution from CCBC for Llanefydd. No change to service. Some scope to increase fares from low base of 60p per single to 80p (this is still significantly less than Arriva)	Fares revision	£3,000		
10	Bodfari – Tremeirchion – Cwm – Dyserth – Rhyl	£2.55	Performs reasonably for a rural bus service. Was recently increased from three to six days a week because the bus has to travel to Rhyl for service 47 anyway.	Possibility of diverting one or two days to Denbigh but this would incur additional marginal additional cost as vehicle needs to be in Rhyl for 1045			
11	Nantglyn – Denbigh High – Ysgol Glan Clwyd	£0.00	Funded by Education (operates schooldays only). Carries students	No action			

11	Rhyl - Prestatyn – Holywell – Flint - Chester (evenings)	N/A	Supports FCC in the provision of this service. No information currently available but believed to perform well. Note the Sunday service is now operated by Arriva commercially	No action			
14	Denbigh – Mold	Awaiting data FCC	Carries students but believed to perform badly off-peak. Possible reduction to an off-peak bus every two hours (currently hourly)	Reduce level of service in consultation with FCC	£15,000		
19	Prestatyn Town	N/A	Diversion of service 19 from rural north west Flintshire via Prestatyn suburbs.	No action			
35	Rhyl – Prestatyn – Meliden – Dyserth – Rhyl circular (evenings)	£0.85	Performs well	No action			
35	Rhyl – Prestatyn – Meliden – Dyserth – Rhyl circular (Sundays)	£0.65	Performs well and contributes to Sunday economy	No action			
37	Dyserth – Prestatyn High School	£0.90	Performs well. Carries students	No action			
38	Prestatyn town service	N/A	Infill services in Prestatyn	Withdraw Saturday afternoon journeys	£5,000		
45/46	Rhyl – Kinmel Bay – Bodelwyddan – Ysbyty Glan Clwyd	£0.86	Performs well. Contribution from CCBC.	No action			
47	Rhyl town service	£2.55	Performs reasonably well	No action			
X50	0750 Ruthin – Wrexham	£3.68	Performs reasonably. Carries workers and students	Required September-December on college days as this acts as a duplicate for Denbighshire students attending Yale College. Possible withdrawal January to July on college days (Rhuddlan – Wrexham college bus to cover) .	£19,000		
X50	0700 Rhuddlan – Denbigh – Ruthin – Wrexham	£0.00	Funded via the home to school budget (operates college days only). Carries significant students	No action			
X50	0805 Denbigh – Ruthin	£1.62	Performs well. Carries workers and students	No action			

50	Uwch y Dre to Ysgol Caer Drewyn	£0.00	Carries students	Operator currently makes no charge though pupils do not qualify for free transport. Introduction of charge deferred owing to Edeirion schools reorganisation but possible measure could be reintroduced	£3,000		
X50	0655 Ruthin – Corwen – Cynwyd (Ifor Williams Factory)	£10.99	Performs poorly. However, service carries workers. Bus then operates on Llandrillo/Cynwyd to Ysgol Dinas Brân service that would be required for students regardless.	No action. The service acts as a positioning movement before and after protected school service and its withdrawal would still mean a bus travelling out of service between Ruthin and Cynwyd/Llandrillo			
X50	Denbigh – Ruthin – Wrexham (Sundays)	£3.18	Performs reasonably. Carries shift workers	No action (may require retendering to assure best value for money)			
X50/2	Rhyl – Denbigh – Ruthin – Wrexham	£1.51	Performs well. Carries shift workers to Highfield Park	No action (may require retendering to assure best value for money)			
X52	Rhyl – Denbigh (Sunday evenings)	£4.80	Performs reasonably considering this service takes over after 2000/2100 each evening (following Arriva commercialising up to this point). Carries shift workers to Highfield Park	No action (may require retendering to assure best value for money)		Reduce service by withdrawing one evening bus	£15,000
54	Rhyl – Rhuddlan – St Asaph Business Park	1.41 (one return trip) or £8.53 (second return trip)	One return journey is well priced and therefore offers good value. The second return journey is more expensive and hence the poor cost per passenger. Performs badly. Provides service exclusively for workers who would otherwise be isolated from St Asaph Business Park	No action (both carry workers who are otherwise isolated from St Asaph Business Park)			
61	Llanefydd – Denbigh High & Ysgol Glan Clwyd	£0.00	Schooldays only and carries primarily students	No action			

62	Llansannan/Bylchau/Groes and Nantglyn/Prion/Saron to Denbigh	£6.24	Performs poorly	Discussions already in place to replace bus service with a demand responsive taxi (may not operate on six days per week)	£8,000		
70/73/77	Betws GG, Clawdd, Clocaenog – Ruthin / Ruthin Town Service / Llanellidan - Ruthin	£7.43	These services have already been reduced following the withdrawal of external funding in August 2011. These now limited services are the only ones that serve the rural area south and west of Ruthin. Externally funded improvements in the Betws GG/Melin y Wig area are under discussion	No further action following August 2011 reductions and possible external funding enhancements. Withdraw later afternoon journeys	£5,000	Reduce service to certain days of the week only	£20,000
76	Denbigh – Llandyrnog – Llanbedr DC – Ruthin – Graigfechan	£1.70	Performs well	Possible withdrawal of little used 1818 Denbigh – Ruthin and or 1910 return	£6,000		
83	Rhyl Town Service (Sundays)	£1.91	Performs well and contributes to Sunday economy	No action			
91/95/98	Melin y Wig – Corwen – Llangollen Melin y Wig – Corwen – Bryneglwys – Wrexham Llangollen – Pentredŵr – Rhewl – Llantysilio	£4.98	Performs poorly. Externally funded improvements in the Betws GG/Melin y Wig area are under discussion	No further action following possible external funding enhancements		Reduce service by two days a week	£8,000
X94	Contribution to Arriva to divert X94 Wrexham – Barmouth service via Cynwyd Llandrillo Contribution to Gwynedd Council for evenings and Sundays	N/A	Contingent upon GC decision (evenings & Sundays)	Review with GC			
97	Llangollen – Pengwern (Saturdays)	£0.67		No action			

Demand responsive Taxi	Llanarmon yn Iâl, Graianrhyd, Eryrys area to meet Wrexham bus at Bwchgwyn	£25.00	Performs extremely poorly but only link from a dispersed rural area to Wrexham. High cost per passenger but only operates on demand and actual costs low	No action			
Demand responsive Taxi	Rhyl – St Asaph Business Park infill taxi service (on demand)	£10.60	Performs badly. Provides service exclusively for workers who would otherwise be isolated from St Asaph Business Park	No action			
Demand responsive Taxi	St Asaph Business Park – Rhyl (specifically for those who leave the police custody suite)	£12.96	Performs badly. Arguably not a Council responsibility (cannot be categorised as work/student, shopping, social or visiting friends & relatives)	Withdraw	£9,800		
Demand responsive Taxi	Denbigh – Llansannan/Nantglyn	£8.83	Provides an afternoon return during school holidays when school bus does not run	Withdraw and encompass in proposals for 62	£800		
Demand responsive Taxi	Denbigh town service	£13.79	Performs poorly. Provides shopping service for those parts of town where bus cannot access.	Encompass in proposals for 62. May not be possible to operate every day	£7,000		
Social car scheme	Sundry rural areas	£1.67	Performs well. Provides for essential journeys for those in the community who cannot use a bus or who have not got one. Operated by volunteers	No action			
Dial-a-Ride	Rhyl, Prestatyn, St Asaph, Rhuddlan and less often Denbigh	£0.94	Performs well but this reflects the Council's own budgets and not other funding sources. These external sources are due to be cut in 2012/13	No action other than try to make DAR more robust			
Nightrider	Rhyl, Prestatyn, St Asaph, Rhuddlan	£2.59	Performs well. Thursday & Friday evening demand responsive service for people over 50 who do not otherwise go out at night	No action			
Rhyl Bus Station inquiry office	Rhyl bus station	N/A	DCC pays rental and utilities. Arriva staffs the office but has now withdrawn staffing.	Notice on unit	£9,500		
Clwydian Ranger	Summer Sunday leisure bus service	N/A	Performs badly but is also funded by FCC and external partners. Costs are low. Dependent upon other funders	No action		Withdraw	£5,000

Publicity	Timetables and other publicity	N/A	Ensures as many passengers know of and can use the bus network. Supports both commercial and contract operators	No action			
Shelters	LTSG provides for bus infrastructure	N/A	This can top up DCC's own maintenance and capital budgets	Withdraw LTSG and use DCC own funding only	£20,000		